

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 09564684 0



UNIVERSITY OF
TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

Materials for

LAW AND MULTICULTURALISM

Spring 2014

Perspective/ICT/SUYRP course

SPRING 2014

VOLUME TWO

Professor Ayelet Shachar

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

STORAGE

KE
4395
.S422
2014
v.2
c.1

Materials reproduced herein are solely for the educational use of students at the University of Toronto Faculty of Law, and are not for commercial sale or use

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

JAN 13 2014

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO



UNIVERSITY OF
TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

Materials for
LAW AND MULTICULTURALISM
Spring 2014
Perspective/ICT/SUYRP course

SPRING 2014

VOLUME TWO

Professor Ayelet Shachar
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

The materials reproduced herein are solely for the educational use of students at the University of Toronto Faculty of Law, and are not for commercial sale or use



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

<https://archive.org/details/materialsforlawm02shac>

Evaluation

Regular class attendance and substantive participation in weekly discussions; and a twenty-four hour take-home examination (100%) which may be signed-out between 9:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. for a 24 hour period during the examination period, Monday to Thursday, excluding weekends to the Faculty’s deadline for second term written work.

VOLUME ONE

I. FOUNDATIONS

1 Introduction

Objectives and design of the course.

Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, s 27, Part I of the Constitution Act, 1982, being Schedule B to the Canada Act 1982 (UK), 1982, c 11 1

Canadian Multiculturalism Act, R.S.C. 1985, c. 24 (4th Supp.) 2

Bill 60, Charter affirming the values of State secularism and religious neutrality and of equality between women and men and providing a framework for accommodation requests, 1st Sess, 40th Leg., Québec, National Assembly, 2013.....12

News Release, Federation of Law Societies of Canada Grants Preliminary Approval of Trinity Western University’s Proposed Law Program, Dec. 16, 2013.....19

James Bradshaw, “Law School that Bans Gay ‘Sexual Intimacy’ Clears Hurdle” The Globe and Mail, Dec. 16, 2013.....21

2 Why Accommodate? Justifications and Tensions

Santa Clara Pueblo et al v Martinez et al, 436 US 49 (1978).....23

Will Kymlicka, Multicultural Citizenship: A Liberal Theory of Minority Rights (Oxford University Press, 1995) 10-44 30

Ayelet Shachar, Multicultural Jurisdictions: Cultural Differences and Women’s Rights (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001) 17-44 49

Martha Minow, “Identities” 3 Yale Journal of Law & the Humanities 97 (1991) 65

II. ILLUSTRATIONS: CONTESTED SOCIAL AND LEGAL ARENAS

3 Citizenship and the Boundaries of Religious Accommodation in the Public Sphere – Canada, France, and Beyond

Ayelet Shachar, “Interpretation Sections (27 and 28) of the Canadian Charter” in *Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms*, eds., Errol Mendes and Stephane Beaulac (5th ed., LexisNexis, Canada, 2013), pp. 147-164.....99

Rogers Brubaker, “Citizenship as Social Closure,” in *Citizenship and Nationhood in France and Germany* (Harvard University Press, 1992) 21-34.....109

“France/Secularism,” *Statement made by President Jacques Chirac*, France, 28 January 28 2004 125

Ayelet Shachar, “Religion, State, and the Problem of Gender: New Modes of Citizenship and Governance in Diverse Societies,” 50 *McGill Law Journal* 49 (2005) 126

Patrick Weil, “A nation in diversity: France, Muslims and the headscarf” *Open Democracy* (25 March 2004) 137

John Bowen, “How the French State Justifies Controlling Muslim Bodies: From Harm-Based to Value-Based Reasoning” 78 *Social Research* 325 (2011).....143

Multani v Commission scolaire Marguerite-Bourgeoys, 2006 SCC 6, [2006] 1 SCR 256 167

Note on *Goldman v Weinberger*, 475 US 503 (1986) in Geoffrey R Stone et al, *Constitutional Law*, 4th ed. (Aspen Law & Business, 2001) 1473-1474 184

Alberta v Hutterian Brethren of Wilson Colony, 2009 SCC 37.....187

R v N.S., 2012 SCC 72.....191

4 The Retreat from Multiculturalism?

Liav Orgad, “Illiberal Liberalism: Cultural Restrictions on Migration and Access to Citizenship in Europe” 58 *American Journal of Comparative Law* 53 (2010) 204

Citizenship and Immigration Canada, “Discover Canada: The Rights and Responsibilities of Citizenship” *Citizenship and Immigration Canada* (2010) 228

“Canadian History a Strong Point with Newcomers,” <i>CBC News</i> , December 27, 2011	235
Pascale Fournier and Erica See, “The ‘Naked Face’ of Secular Exclusion: Bill 94 and the Privatization of Belief,” 30 <i>Windsor Yearbook of Access to Justice</i> 63 (2012)	236
Ayelet Shachar, “Interpretation Sections (27 and 28) of the Canadian Charter” in <i>Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms</i> , eds., Errol Mendes and Stephane Beaulac (5 th ed., LexisNexis, Canada, 2013), pp. 165-178	238
Silvia Borelli, “Towards a Less Secular Europe? The Decision of the Grand Chamber of the European Court of Human Rights in <i>Lautsi v Italy</i> ” (2011) 15 <i>Insights</i>	246
<i>Lautsi v Italy</i> [GC], No 30814/06, [2011] ECHR	253
5 Community, Education and Diversity	
Avishai Margalit & Moshe Halbertal, “Liberalism and the Right to Culture” 71 <i>Social Research</i> 529 (2004)	256
<i>Wisconsin v Yoder</i> , 406 US 205 (1972)	257
William A. Galston, “Two Conceptions of Liberalism” 105 <i>Ethics</i> 516 (1995)	260
Stephen Macedo, “Liberal Civic Education and Religious Fundamentalism: The Case of God v. John Rawls?” 105 <i>Ethics</i> 468 (1995)	279
“Accommodations for Religious Observances” (2012), online: University of Toronto < http://www.vicprovoststudents.utoronto.ca/publicationsandpolicies/guidelines/religiousobservances.htm >	308
<i>SL v Commission scolaire des Chênes</i> , 2012 SCC 7	310
<i>R v Jones</i> [1986] 2 SCR 284	323
S M Corbett, “ <i>Adler v Ontario</i> – The Troubling Legacy of A Compromise” 8 <i>Constitutional Forum</i> 64 (1997)	327

VOLUME TWO

6 Where Do Children Belong? Custody and Visitation; “Identity” Matters

Linda J Lacey, “Liberal Thought and Religion in Custody and Visitation Cases,”
in Stephen M Feldman, ed., *Law and Religion: A Critical Anthology*
(New York: NYU Press, 2000) 411 1

Kimberly Van De Perre v Theodore Edwards [2001] 2 SCR 1014 10

The Indian Child Welfare Act of 1978 [United States] 34

Mississippi Band of Choctaw Indians v Holyfield, 409 US 30 (1989) 38

National Congress of American Indians, “U.S. Supreme Court Upholds Indian
Child Welfare Act in Adoptive Couple v. Baby Girl,” June 25, 2013 41

Ayelet Shachar, “Demystifying Culture” 10 *International Journal of*
Constitutional Law 429 (2012) 43

7 Medical Decisions; Mature Minors’ Right to Die?

Re J (An Infant): B and B v Director General of Social Welfare [1996]
NZLR 134 [New Zealand] 53

Zenon M Bodnaruk et al, “Meeting the Clinical Challenge of Care for Jehovah’s
Witnesses” 18 *Transfusion Medicine Reviews* 105 (2004) 61

Rick Pedersen, “Don’t Force Transfusions, Court Told”, *National Post*
(25 August 2003) A7 71

Alberta (Director of Child Welfare) v H (B) [2002] Alta D 360.25.70.20-02 72

Jenny Percival & Paul Lewis, “Teenager Who Wins Right to Die: ‘I Have Had
Too Much Trauma’”, *The Gnardian* (11 November 2008) 85

Don Ellis, “We Told Her We Loved Her”, *The Guardian* (12 November 2008) 87

8 Customary and Religious Personal Laws; Marriage and Divorce

David L. Chambers, “Civilizing the Natives: Marriage in Post-Apartheid
South Africa” 129 *Daedalus* 101 (2000) 89

<i>Reference re Section 293 of the Criminal Code of Canada</i> , 2011 BCSC 1588	113
Marie-Aimee Helie-Lucas, “The Preferential Symbol for Islamic Identity: Women in Muslim Personal Laws,” in Valentine M Moghadam, ed., <i>Identity Politics and Women</i> (Westview Press, 1994) 391	116
Ayelet Shachar, <i>Multicultural Jurisdictions: Cultural Differences and Women’s Rights</i> (Cambridge University Press, 2001) 45-62	127
<i>Mohd Ahmed Khan v Shah Bano Begum</i> , AIR 1985 SC 945 [India]	133
Samia Bano, “Muslim and South Asian Women: Customary Law and Citizenship in Britain,” in Nira Yuval-Davis and Pnina Werbner, eds., <i>Women, Citizenship, and Difference</i> (Zed Books, 1999) 162-177	145
9 Privatizing Diversity; Faith-Based Tribunals in a Constitutional State?	
“Darul-Qada: Beginnings of Muslim Civil Justice System in Canada” <i>The Canadian Society of Muslims</i> (April 2003)	154
<i>Arbitration Act</i> , SO C 1991, c 17 ss.6, 17-20	157
“Position Statement on the Proposed Implementation of Sections of Muslim Law [Sharia] in Canada” <i>Canadian Council of Muslim Women</i> (25 May 2004)	160
Marion Boyd, “Religiously-Based Alternative Dispute Resolution: A Challenge to Multiculturalism”(2006) <i>Canadian Diversity</i>	167
Ministry of the Attorney General, <i>Background: The Family Statute Law Amendment Act, 2005</i> (15 November 2005)	172
<i>Family Arbitration</i> , O Reg 134/07	174
David Pearl & Werner Menski, “Informal Muslim Dispute Settlement Processes,” in <i>Muslim Family Law</i> (Sweet and Maxwell, 1998), 77-80	178
III INSTITUTIONAL AND PARTICIPATORY ATTEMPTS TO REDUCE THE TENSIONS BETWEEN EQUALITY AND DIVERSITY	
10 Internal Change, Legal Innovation, and Regulated Interaction	
Kecia Ali, “Acting on a Frontier of Religious Ceremony” 32 <i>Harvard Divinity Bulletin</i> 8 (2004)	181

Daood Hamdani, “Can women change the face of North American mosques?” <i>CGNews</i> (20 July 2012)	186
Ayelet Shachar, “Feminism and Multiculturalism: Mapping the Terrain,” in David Owen & Anthony Laden, eds., <i>Multiculturalism and Political Theory</i> (Cambridge University Press, 2007) 130-136	188
<i>Bruker v Marcovitz</i> [2007] 3 SCR 607	193
Ran Hirschl, “Constitutional Courts vs. Religious Fundamentalism: Three Middle Eastern Tales” 82 <i>Texas Law Review</i> 1819 (2014)	221
11 International Law, Norm Diffusion, and the Recognition/Regulation of Diversity	
<i>Lovelace v. Canada</i> UN GOAR, 36th Sess., Supp. No. 40, UN Doc. A/36/40 (1981)	236
Steven Vertovec, “‘Diversity’ and the Social Imaginary” 53 <i>European Journal of Sociology</i> 287 (2012)	245
Zachary Elkins, Tom Ginsburg & Beth Simmons, “Getting to Rights: Treaty Ratification, Constitutional Convergence, and Human Rights Practice” 54 <i>Harvard International Law Journal</i> 61 (2013)	265
Galit Sarfaty, “International Norm Diffusion in the Pimicikamak Cree Nation: A Model of Legal Mediation” 48 <i>Harvard International Law Journal</i> 441 (2008)	273
Epilogue	
Salman Rushdie, “Good Advice is Rarer than Rubies” in <i>East, West: Stories</i> (Vintage International, 1994), 5-16	295